Increasing Teacher Diversity

Strategies to Improve the Teacher Workforce

Saba Bireda and Robin Chait  November 2011
Increasing Teacher Diversity

Strategies to Improve the Teacher Workforce

Saba Bireda and Robin Chait  November 2011

Progress 2050, a project of the Center for American Progress, seeks to lead, broaden, and strengthen the progressive movement by working toward a more inclusive progressive agenda—one that truly reflects our nation’s rich ethnic and racial diversity. By 2050 there will be no ethnic majority in our nation and to ensure that the unprecedented growth of communities of color also yields future prosperity, we work to close racial disparities across the board with innovative policies that work for all.
In the fall of 2010, U.S. Secretary of Education Arne Duncan launched a national initiative, Teach.gov to recruit the “next generation” of teachers. Duncan emphasized one particular objective for the program—building a more diverse teaching force:

*I’m very concerned that increasingly, our teachers don’t reflect the great diversity of our nation’s young people, and so making sure we have more teachers of color and particularly more men, more black and Latino men, coming into education is going to be a significant part of this Teach Campaign.*

Secretary Duncan’s charge reflects a growing concern about the number of teachers of color in America’s classrooms. Nationally, minority students make up 40.7 percent of the public school population. Although many schools (both urban and rural) are increasingly made up of a majority of black and Latino students, black and Latino teachers represent only about 14.6 percent of the teaching workforce. The scarcity of minority teachers is not limited to any one type of school—in over 40 percent of public schools there is not a single teacher of color. And in urban and high-poverty schools where minority teachers are disproportionately employed, teaching staffs are still predominately composed of white teachers.

The lack of diversity in the teaching force is troubling for several reasons. Fewer minority teachers may indicate that few minorities are interested in pursuing a career in teaching. The low number of minority teachers also may indicate that there are fewer minority candidates with the skills and qualifications to enter the field. The inability to retain highly effective minority teachers, like all teachers, is also a challenge for many schools and districts and may indicate high turnover of certain teachers.

Increasing the number of teachers of color is not only a matter of a philosophical commitment to diversity in career opportunities. Teachers of color provide real-life examples to minority students of future career paths. In this way, increasing the number of current teachers of color may be instrumental to increasing the
number of future teachers of color. And while there are effective teachers of many races, teachers of color have demonstrated success in increasing academic achievement for engaging students of similar backgrounds.  

Policymakers concerned with staffing at challenging schools also have another incentive to increase the number of teachers of color. High minority, high-poverty schools are often the hardest schools to staff and research indicates that minority teachers at the schools are more likely to pursue employment at schools with high minority student populations. Often these schools are in low-income areas or districts. The successful recruitment and retention of effective minority teachers at struggling schools may prove to be a powerful tool in creating a stable workforce and thereby increase student achievement. 

The Center for American Progress has consistently called for a national agenda to increase the number of effective teachers staffed at high poverty, high minority schools. Research demonstrates that effective instruction has more influence on student performance than do other resources within the school. Federal, state, and local policymakers have gradually begun to recognize this fact and have started developing methods to assess teacher effectiveness, incorporate effectiveness into human capital policies, and create pathways and incentives for effective teachers to work at the schools where they are needed the most. The Center for American Progress has discussed other retention strategies, such as providing mentoring and induction programs, creating career ladders and diverse roles for teachers, and differentiating pay, in previous work. Strategies to increase the number of minority teachers must also operate in this framework and focus on developing training and tools to ensure these teachers will be effective in the classroom. 

As Secretary Duncan’s quote denotes, there is a push on both the national and local level to increase the number of teachers of color. The recruitment of such teachers can be a difficult and time-intensive task. States and districts across the country, as well as a number of national organizations, have devised successful strategies for recruiting teachers of color. 

These strategies appear to have had some impact on diversity. There was a 96 percent increase in the number of minority teachers over the past 20 years, compared with a 41 percent increase in white teachers. But the news on the other end is decidedly negative. Recent research on teacher retention reveals that schools may be losing minority teachers just as they are pulling more into the classroom. University of Pennsylvania professors Richard Ingersoll and Henry
May’s research on the minority teacher shortage found that while the overall number of minority teachers has increased, turnover rates are significantly higher for minorities than for white teachers.9

During the 2003-04 school year, for example, about 20 percent more minority teachers left the field than entered.10 Such high attrition rates can neutralize the effective recruitment strategies resulting in a teacher workforce that does not reflect America’s student population.

Ingersoll and May’s research highlights the importance of approaching the minority teacher shortage with dual strategies of recruitment and retention. The reasons for teacher attrition are varied and implicate a number of factors, including district/school dysfunction, pay, and personal career objectives. We know that teachers at high-poverty schools are especially at risk for turnover as such schools present teachers with a unique set of challenges. Schools and districts that do not provide teachers with support will continue to face high turnover.

Recruitment alone will not solve the minority teacher shortage, but highly effective strategies may increase the number of entering teachers to a rate that outpaces turnover. Finely tuned recruitment efforts that seek teachers who are likely to succeed and provide support while in the classroom, even in challenging schools, can help in increasing retention. This paper will highlight elements of these innovative recruitment strategies, present brief case studies of programs, and suggest recommendations for state and local policy to support such programs and strategies.

These recommendations include:

• Increasing federal oversight of and increased accountability for teacher preparation programs. This is the first step in ensuring that minority teachers emerge from teacher preparation programs with the skills needed to be effective teachers. The federal government can also take the lead on requesting programs to report on diversity efforts.

• Creating statewide initiatives to fund teacher preparation programs aimed at low-income and minority teachers.

• Strengthening federal financial aid programs for low-income students entering the teaching field.
• Reducing the cost of becoming a teacher by creating more avenues to enter the field and increasing the number of qualified credentialing organizations.

• Strengthening state-sponsored and nonprofit teacher recruitment and training organizations by increasing standards for admission, using best practices to recruit high-achieving minority students, and forming strong relationships with districts to ensure recruitment needs are met.
Behind the shortage

Why are there so few teachers of color in proportion to students? Much of the shortage problem starts with the low rates of academic achievement for students of color. High school graduation, an absolute requirement for entering the teaching field, continues to elude many black, Latino, and Native American students. Graduation rates are 56 percent, 54 percent, and 51 percent for Latino, black, and Native American students respectively. College-going rates are similarly low for students of color—only 56 percent of black students who complete high school and only 64 percent of Latino high school graduates successfully matriculate to college. African Americans and Latinos also struggle to complete college. The six-year graduation rate for African Americans was only 40.5 percent in 2007. Latinos graduated at a slightly higher rate of 46.8 percent.

The dismal rate of high school and college completion for students of color immediately minimizes the number of eligible candidates for the teaching field. A separate set of challenges arises when transitioning college graduates into teaching. For example, historically black college and universities, or HBCUs, have traditionally supplied many of the nation’s African American teachers. However, the United Negro College Fund, an organization of private HBCUs, reports that the expansion of career opportunities for minority graduates combined with negative experiences with teachers in their own schooling discourages many students at UNCF member schools from pursuing a teaching career. And for those students who do want to be teachers, a lack of academic preparedness for college can undermine even the best efforts. UNCF also found that many students in teacher-education programs at their HBCUs faced significant difficulties in passing the basic skills exams that are required for licensure in most states.

In addition to a lack of academic preparation, economic, societal, and cultural factors also depress the number of high-quality college graduates of color who become teachers. The high cost of college drives many graduates to more lucrative careers in order to pay back student loans. Unlike some graduate school programs or professional schools, teacher preparation programs require students to take out large loans with little promise of financial reward. With these constraints, teaching has steadily lost prestige among college students, becoming a career of last option, often for low performers. The next section will explore the difficulties states,
districts, and nonprofit organizations face in trying to recruit and place African American and Latino teachers in the classroom.

State and district efforts to recruit teachers of color

States and districts have tremendous incentives to recruit teachers of color. Schools serving large numbers of minorities typically have difficulty attracting high-performing teachers who are likely to stay in the classroom. Minority teachers tend to purposefully choose these schools. Districts that successfully recruit effective teachers of color may have an advantage in retaining these teachers at hard-to-staff schools.

And while further research is needed on the link between minority teachers and increased academic achievement for minority students, there is evidence that some students respond positively to teachers who share their same background. Teachers who share the same background with their students may also be more apt at incorporating cultural references and other culture-specific tools in instruction. These practices are not limited to minority teachers nor are they necessary to effectively instruct students of color, but such benefits should not be ignored—especially in schools where teachers struggle to engage students.

We know that traditional teacher-education programs produce the majority of teachers in this country and their use should not be overlooked as a strategy. However, states and districts have also begun to use other programs in an effort to attract candidates not typically found in traditional teacher education.

These programs include:

- **Alternative certification programs** such as Teach for America, district-led programs such as the Boston Teacher Residency program, and local programs run by outside providers such as the New York Teaching Fellows/The New Teacher Project. Alternative certification programs often specifically focus on recruiting teachers to hard-to-staff schools.

- **Grow-Your-Own programs.** In a “Grow Your Own” program, a school district partners with an institution of higher education to prepare paraprofessionals, other school staff, or other members of the community who are not certified as teachers to teach in the district.
The theory is that drawing from the school community will yield teachers who are more likely to match the racial, ethnic, and economic characteristics of the students and will be more likely to stay in the district for a longer period of time. This theory is supported by research that finds that teachers prefer to teach in geographic locations that are similar to the place where they grew up—i.e., if they grew up in an urban area, they prefer to teach in an urban area. Many teachers also prefer to teach in schools where they share the race and ethnicity of the majority of the students.

- **Early outreach programs.** Early outreach programs attempt to attract high school students into the profession before they enter college. Early outreach programs exist in urban high schools across the country and can provide a direct pathway from high school into teaching. Minority high school students have an opportunity to build more positive feelings about teaching through these programs and may also receive financial support through college if they commit to becoming a teacher. The disadvantage of these programs is that they are recruiting very young people into teaching and may not be able to adequately identify participants who have the skills, motivation, and attitude to be successful teachers.

- **Traditional teacher preparation and district partnerships.** Districts can also create direct partnerships with local universities with large numbers of minority students. UNCF supports one such program that links Norfolk State University with the South Coast Partnership for the Journey into Education and Teaching, or JET, a collaboration led by the University of Massachusetts Dartmouth, with Bristol Community College, Lesley University, and the Fall River and New Bedford school districts and their respective paraprofessional unions, “There are few programs serving paraprofessionals because it’s very labor intensive for the people who run the programs.” “Those candidates who are succeeding are succeeding extraordinarily well—their GPAs are between 3 and 3.88. Getting through the undergraduate program, however, is a stretch for many in the beginning. It’s a stretch because of both academic rigor and life circumstances. The average age of paraprofessionals in the JET program is in the 40s. Most of them have families and obligations. Some are the primary breadwinner on a paraprofessional salary and are under a lot of financial pressure. They find the university courses to be much more challenging than the community college courses they have taken. Particularly in the beginning, they need a lot of support academically, personally, and emotionally. We need to build their confidence to succeed. The JET program has had great support from the University (University of Massachusetts Dartmouth). They have been able to find an academic program director and academic advisor at the University who are equally committed to student’s success.”

---

**Insight into grow-your-own programs**

According to the program director of the South Coast Partnership for the Journey into Education and Teaching, or JET, a collaboration led by the University of Massachusetts Dartmouth, with Bristol Community College, Lesley University, and the Fall River and New Bedford school districts and their respective paraprofessional unions, “There are few programs serving paraprofessionals because it’s very labor intensive for the people who run the programs.” “Those candidates who are succeeding are succeeding extraordinarily well—their GPAs are between 3 and 3.88. Getting through the undergraduate program, however, is a stretch for many in the beginning. It’s a stretch because of both academic rigor and life circumstances. The average age of paraprofessionals in the JET program is in the 40s. Most of them have families and obligations. Some are the primary breadwinner on a paraprofessional salary and are under a lot of financial pressure. They find the university courses to be much more challenging than the community college courses they have taken. Particularly in the beginning, they need a lot of support academically, personally, and emotionally. We need to build their confidence to succeed. The JET program has had great support from the University (University of Massachusetts Dartmouth). They have been able to find an academic program director and academic advisor at the University who are equally committed to student’s success.”
to the Richmond Public School system. Call Me Mister, a statewide initiative in South Carolina, links black male graduates of area colleges to high-minority, high-poverty schools in the state. Such partnerships have a high likelihood for rapidly increasing the number of minority teachers in an area, but many teacher preparation programs have been slow to track the effectiveness of their graduates.

Many states and districts are utilizing elements of these programs in their recruitment efforts. As indicated above, a successful recruitment strategy hinges not only on the program’s ability to put teachers of color in classrooms, but also on identifying minority teachers with high potential to be effective in the classroom.
Case studies

The case studies in this section highlight several different types of strategies used to recruit minority teachers. Some of the case studies describe programs with a national scope while others have a particular regional focus. Each program offers its own particular approach to recruitment, training and support, and placement. The programs have demonstrated varied levels of success in their recruitment efforts but all enrich the discussion around recruitment and the minority teacher shortage.

Our case studies include:

• Teach for America
• The New Teacher Project-Fellowship Programs
• Urban Teacher Enhancement Program
• North Carolina Teaching Fellows Scholarship Program
• Teach Tomorrow-Oakland

Let’s begin with Teach for America.

Teach For America

General program description

Teach For America is widely known as one of the country’s largest—and most selective—alternative certification programs. TFA recruits college graduates to teach in 39 underserved areas across the country for two years. The program focuses on selecting extremely high-achieving candidates to become corps members, with the belief that those candidates who exhibit certain characteristics are likely to be highly successful in the classroom. While TFA corps members do fulfill traditional teacher licensure requirements, they do not necessarily have an undergraduate background in education or a commitment to a long-term teaching career.

TFA is frequently criticized for the transience of its corps members, but the program has had a fair amount of success in recruiting and retaining minority teachers while other traditional programs struggle to attract minority teachers. TFA
recruits a wide cross-section of candidates but with the help of dedicated funding, began targeted outreach to under-represented minorities in 2009.

A recent study of TFA found that black and Latino corps members enjoy longer teaching careers, on average, than white and Asian teachers. On average, compared to whites and Asians, Latino teachers’ careers are a half-year longer and black teachers’ careers are nearly one year longer. This data is especially important as black and Latino TFA teachers have typically graduated from selective colleges and have multiple career opportunities available to them.

**Recruitment and selection**

TFA aligns its recruitment goals with current demographics at the country’s 400 most selective colleges. African Americans comprise a little over 5 percent of these graduates while Latinos are a little over 6 percent. Therefore, in 2011 TFA set recruitment goals of 11 percent African American corps members, and 8.5 percent Latino corps members, in order to outpace the rate of African American and Latino students at selective colleges. Figure 1 below demonstrates the diversity of 2011 TFA corps members.

The key to TFA’s success in recruiting high numbers of minority, and particularly African American teachers, appears to be the intensive relationship building the organization undertakes with individual candidates. The relationship building can start months before a potential applicant actually decides to apply to TFA. Its staff assigned to campuses may contact individual students for meetings, ask alumni to call interested students, and invite students to on-campus programming. TFA found that alumni were particularly helpful in convincing potential candidates to apply and matriculate.

**Training and support**

TFA corps members participate in a five-week training “institute” prior to entering the classroom. Corps members teach summer school students with a lead teacher for part of the day and also take courses and plan lessons for their summer school students. After corps members start the year and enter the classroom, they continue to receive one-on-one coaching from TFA instructional coaches in their region.
TFA’s goal is to develop leaders who are working at every level of education, policy and other professions, to ensure that all children growing up in poverty are receiving access to an excellent education. TFA corps members are well known for migrating from the classroom into other positions in education and other fields, but the organization is attempting to increase the number of teachers that remain in the classroom. The organization’s “Teacher Leadership Initiative” encourages corps members in their second year to consider teaching beyond their commitment. The organization pairs teachers with more veteran TFA alumni teachers as mentors. It also assists teachers with finding career opportunities and pursuing National Board Certification. TFA estimates that two-thirds of its alumni remain in education, and about half of that number consists of teachers.

The New Teacher Project- Fellowship Programs

General program description

The New Teacher Project operates fellowship programs in districts across the country. TNTP facilitates alternative certification programs for high-achieving postgraduates and mid-career professionals who typically lack a traditional education background. The program contracts with districts in 18 cities and specifically recruits teachers for hard-to-staff schools.

TNTP tailors its fellowship programs to the needs of districts. Districts concerned about the homogeneity of its teachers have turned to TNTP to create targeted recruiting campaigns for minority candidates. For example, in Nashville, where the majority of students are non-white, white teachers make up about 60 percent of the teaching force. The school district contracted with TNTP to start the Nashville Teaching Fellows. The program seeks to bring new, diverse teachers into Nashville classrooms. By focusing on older college graduates and mid-career changers, TNTP Fellows often are in a more secure financial position and can afford the transition to a teaching career.

Recruitment and selection

TNTP staff study demographic data in each of their districts to determine the potential pool of applicants. The program then creates a marketing campaign
to specifically resonate with likely candidates. In recruiting minority candidates, marketing campaigns often stress the need for new teachers to close the achievement gap between minority and white students. More personal messages promote the experience of teaching in communities that are similar to where potential applicants were raised. TNTP uses an array of recruitment tools including Internet appeals, grassroots messaging, and referrals from current teachers. TNTP staff, like TFA staff, also invests considerable time in communicating directly with potential applicants. The organization hosts small group gatherings for potential applicants to meet current teachers and tries to strategically offer applicants opportunities to meet participants with similar backgrounds.

As shown in the figure above, people of color make up a significant portion of the current fellows in districts across the country. TNTP estimates that 37 percent of their fellows are people of color, compared with the 17.6 percent of teachers nationally.27

Training and support

TNTP fellows attend a summer training institute prior to entering the classroom. TNTP also provides school districts with professional development aimed at increasing the effectiveness of new teachers.

Retention efforts

TNTP Fellows have made the decision to purposefully change their career path and choose teaching. Therefore, the program has enjoyed higher than average
retention rates for its fellows compared to traditional teachers. The program has an 87 percent retention rate for teachers in their second year. Retention rates for black and Latino fellows are slightly higher than for other fellows in both New York City (TNTP’s flagship fellows program) and nationally.

The figure above shows the percentage of black and Latino fellows starting their second, third, and fourth year of teaching in 2010 compared to other fellows.

### Diversity and retention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>New York City teaching fellows</th>
<th>Teaching fellows (does not include NYCTF)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>NYC teaching fellows who are Black/Latino</strong></td>
<td><strong>All NYC teaching fellows</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start Y2</td>
<td>92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start Y3</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start Y4</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: NYCTF FellowTrack Database, November 2010, TeacherTrack Database, November 2010

### Urban Teacher Enhancement Program

#### General program description

The Urban Teacher Enhancement Program was established in 2004 to prepare teachers who have a commitment to urban schools and “who have the knowledge, skills and dispositions to promote high achievement in urban schools and who have a commitment to remaining in urban schools.”29 The program is a partnership between the University of Alabama at Birmingham and three high-needs school districts in the Birmingham, Alabama metropolitan area: Birmingham City, Bessemer, and Fairfield. The program recruits mid-career professionals, recent college graduates who did not major in education, and prepares paraprofessionals and other school staff in the participating school districts to teach in high-needs areas. The high-needs areas are identified by the participating school districts and currently include secondary math, science, English, social studies, elementary education, special education, and English as a Second Language.

The program is unique because the teacher preparation curriculum is specifically focused on developing a set of competencies related to urban teaching. In addition, coursework is co-taught by university faculty and master teachers from the partner districts. One funding source for the program is a Transition to Teaching Grant from the U.S. Department of Education. Program funds pay for a portion of participant tuition—up to $5,000 per candidate—and helps compensate mentors and co-teachers. The program takes two to three years for part-time students.
and one and a half years for full-time students. Participants commit to teach in the
district for a specified period of time; for example, the Transition Routes to Urban
Education program requires a three-year teaching commitment.

Recruitment and selection

UTEP uses a variety of recruitment methods to reach minority candidates.
They ask administrators in their partner districts to refer promising school
staff. They also do direct mailings to paraprofessionals, substitute teachers, and
other school staff. They also reach out to community leaders. In addition, they
recruit candidates from undergraduate mathematics and science programs at
the University of Alabama at Birmingham. They have information sessions for
these undergraduates and engage graduates of the program to talk to potential
recruits. They also use a promotional video.

UTEP has a competitive selection process. Applicants must first be accepted into
one of three programs in order to participate in UTEP: the Teacher Education
Program for undergraduate students, and either the Alternative Masters Program
or Traditional Masters Program for graduate students. Participants entering the
graduate program are required to have a specific score on the GRE or Miller’s
Analogy Test. Participants entering the undergraduate route are required to have a
minimum 2.50 GPA. All candidates also must supply a writing sample, a state-
ment explaining why they would be a good candidate, and must participate in an
interview. UTEP program staff screen all applicants and then conduct in-person
interviews with promising applicants. Their district and university partners par-
ticipate in the interview process; they see about 100-150 applications each year
and select 20-30 people for the UTEP program.

UTEP currently has 70 participants, four or five of whom are paraprofessionals.
The majority of participants are transitioning from another career. Fewer than 10
paraprofessionals participate in the program at any one time. Bachelor’s degrees are
not required for paraprofessionals to participate in the program, but they do have to
complete the pre-requisite coursework for teacher preparation, and must submit the
writing sample and participate in an interview like the other candidates.

UTEP participants are well positioned to get positions with partner districts, since
the districts are involved in selecting and supporting them. The districts, however,
are not committed to hiring specific candidates. UTEP provides seminars for participants to coach them on the hiring process. In recent years, the hiring process has been more difficult because of hiring freezes, but participants usually do get jobs.

Training and support

When UTEP was established, a team from the University of Alabama at Birmingham and the Birmingham City Schools developed the Urban Teacher Enhancement Program competencies that are embedded in all of the UTEP courses. The competencies are organized in four strands: affirming attitude, socio-cultural competence, collaborative skills, and pedagogy for diversity. The UTEP courses enhance the traditional education programs. Participants study a variety of content areas, but take a set of UTEP courses as a cohort in addition to the regular course of study for education students. The courses are co-taught by university faculty and master teachers from the partner districts. They include courses in classroom management, curriculum, teaching students with disabilities, and assessment. They also have arrangements with participating districts to place UTEP participants in fieldwork experiences that are integrated throughout the program. Participants are required to have a minimum of 180 field hours prior to teaching.

Faculty liaisons work as mentors to teacher candidates to ensure they successfully complete the program. About 90 percent of participants complete it, but UTEP counsels candidates out of the program if they don’t do well in the course work. Assessments of the Urban Teacher Enhancement competencies are built into the courses, so doing poorly in the courses is an indication that they haven’t mastered the competencies. Candidates must maintain a GPA of 3.0 in the graduate program and 2.75 in the undergraduate program. Participants may also get disposition statements for being late to class, submitting assignments late, making unprofessional statements, or violating confidentiality. These statements are also considered in a decision to dismiss a candidate.

UTEP provides a range of resources to support teacher candidates. UTEP has portable technology centers that participants can check out to use in classes that include a laptop, a projector, and speakers. They have a small UTEP library that specializes in teaching in diverse schools. They also arrange seminars, social gatherings, electronic newsletters, and opportunities for the teachers to network.
Once candidates exit the program, UTEP provides mentors for teachers’ first three years of teaching. UTEP is able to pay exemplary teachers in partner districts a stipend to serve as mentors through their grant funding.

**Results and evaluation**

Many of the grants that support UTEP require teachers to commit to teach for a specific number of years. Across three years, UTEP has a retention rate of about 70 percent, which varies by grant. TRUE, the Transition Routes to Urban Education grant, a Transition to Teaching grant funded by the U.S. Department of Education, requires a commitment of three years, and about 80 percent of graduates teach in high-poverty schools. About 70 percent of UTEP participants are African American.

UTEP staff evaluates participants’ mastery of the competencies while they are in the program. They use a rubric aligned with the UTEP competencies that evaluates the extent to which the candidates meet each one. They have also developed an observational rubric for the field experiences that is grounded in the competencies. And they have started comparing the classroom practice of UTEP to non-UTEP graduates using an observational rubric. UTEP staff would like to know if their graduates look any different once in the classroom.

Director Deborah Voltz states that she is most proud of the genuine collaboration that UTEP has with its partner districts. The program meets a real need of the partner districts and the principals that UTEP has worked with are eager to hire UTEP graduates.

**North Carolina Teaching Fellows Scholarship Program**

**General program description**

The North Carolina Teaching Fellows program was enacted by the state’s General Assembly in 1986 with a mission to recruit talented high school graduates into teaching and to help them develop leadership skills. The program is funded by the state and provides a $6,500 yearly scholarship to 500 participants for four years. The funding also supports training and support activities as well as summer learning experiences. Participants must be accepted to one of the 17 public and private colleges or universities in the state that participate in the program and complete a
A teacher preparation program at one of these schools. Last year, 2,000 high school seniors applied for 500 slots.

In return for the scholarship, participants must agree to teach for four years after college graduation in one of North Carolina’s public schools. If the recipient cannot repay the scholarship through service, they must repay the loan to the state with 10 percent interest. Recipients must be legal residents of North Carolina and have lived in the state for 12 months. The program also provides supplementary educational experiences that enrich participants’ education and develop their leadership skills.

Recruitment and selection

NCTF staff members engage in aggressive recruitment to find talented candidates and to recruit higher proportions of minority and male candidates than traditional teacher preparation programs in North Carolina. Four years ago, NCTF created a director of recruitment position charged with increasing minority participation. Through a variety of outreach strategies, he and his staff have helped the organization consistently meet its annual recruiting goals of 20 percent minority participants and 30 percent male participants.

One of the primary recruitment strategies is called Project Teach. Through Project Teach, recruiters identify school districts that have high populations of minority students and have average to above-average achievement. They are currently working with 24 districts. Within these districts, recruiters identify a school-system liaison, which is NCTF’s main point of contact. The liaison is charged with creating a team of community-based representatives, facilitating information distribution to parents and students, and helping students apply to college and to NCTF. This strategy proved critical, as NCTF staff found that a lot of the students that they were targeting hadn’t taken the steps they needed to take to apply to college.

Training and support

Once candidates are accepted into the program, they enroll in a teacher certification program in one of 17 participating colleges. They also participate in a variety of activities that extend beyond traditional teacher preparation. These additional activities include seminars on current education trends, social activities with other
fellows, and early field experiences in public schools, including tutoring, mentoring, and shadowing teachers. They also must participate in a variety of summer learning experiences, including a bus tour of a range of schools systems throughout the state, internships, travel opportunities, and professional development.

After completing the program, participants apply for teaching positions. The program does not provide assistance to participants in finding jobs with the exception of publishing of an annual employment directory on their website.

Results and evaluation

While most candidates successfully complete the program and stay in the teaching profession, the program does not monitor the effectiveness of graduates of the program in the classroom or track their evaluation data. From the classes of 1987-2005, 84 percent of participants graduated from the program. Moreover, in 2009-10, 86 percent of graduates were employed in their fifth year after their four-year commitment was completed and 65 percent were employed after their fifth year.

Teach Tomorrow in Oakland

General program description

Teach Tomorrow in Oakland, California, is a partnership between the Oakland mayor’s office and Oakland Unified School District, whose goal is to recruit and retain excellent teachers who “reflect the ethnic and cultural diversity” of Oakland. TTO works collaboratively with university and community partners to attract and prepare talented teachers who are committed to three key principles: “ensuring that all students achieve at high levels, professional development, and long-term employment within OUSD.” TTO only recruits candidates who have lived in Oakland for at least five years.

Two years ago, an education task force initiated by Mayor Ronald Dellum recommended the program after finding that the city needed a program to get local residents into teaching. All participants must make a five-year commitment, formalized through a memorandum of understanding, to teach in Oakland or pay back the tuition they receive.
The program includes four recruitment strands:

• **Oakland’s alumni and community members.** TTO recruits participants and staff from Oakland civic, community, and faith based organizations. It also includes alumni of Oakland schools.

• **Middle and high school students.** TTO supports middle school teaching clubs and implements Education Academies at several Oakland high schools. TTO provides financial assistance to OUSD alumni who enroll in programs that provide them with teacher certification and plan to return to Oakland to teach.

• **OUSD employees.** TTO recruits promising paraprofessionals and other school staff who are interested in becoming educators, and supports them in completing a bachelor’s degree and teaching credential, and finding a teaching position.

• **Student teachers.** OUSD partners with local colleges and universities to identify high performing student teachers in OUSD schools and help them transition into positions in the district.

TTO recruits candidates from all of these strands and supports them in earning a teaching credential and becoming a Teacher Intern in the district. Teacher Interns receive intensive summer preparation and then assistance with finding a position within the district. TTO supports applicants without bachelor’s degrees in finding funding to complete their degree and then supports them in becoming a Teacher Intern. Applicants who have bachelor’s degrees may apply to become a Teacher Intern directly.

The program is funded through a variety of sources including the Transition to Teaching grant, state money, foundation grants, and the school district. The Transition to Teaching grant pays for everything related to the Teacher Intern program, including professional development, test preparation, supplies, and tuition. The state pays for the paraprofessional program and tuition for the paraprofessionals to complete their bachelor’s degree and teaching credential. A grant from the David and Lucile Packard Foundation pays for two years of junior college for high school students, and the Oakland School District pays for the program director’s salary. The program director is currently working to secure permanent funding for the program.
Recruitment and selection

The district gives TTO a certain number of slots that they are allowed to fill, so they know how many Teacher Interns they can place. The program recruits heavily in the communities where they want their teachers to teach. They hire recruiters who reflect the diversity of the people that they are recruiting and who are part of the communities where they are recruiting. They inundate local schools with flyers. They also use other nontraditional recruitment strategies, such as advertising in Spanish speaking newspapers and in churches. These strategies seem to pay off, as many of their participants come from local churches.

Interested applicants undergo a thorough evaluation to become a Teacher Intern. TTO interviews both fully credentialed applicants and those who will need to earn a credential through the program. The application process begins in January for the upcoming fall. Principals conduct a rigorous interview process where each applicant teaches a sample lesson. In addition to participating in the sample lesson, students provide feedback on candidates after each lesson. They are asked to answer questions such as: Did I learn anything? Did I feel like I would want this teacher in my school?

The paraprofessional pathway is the most challenging recruitment strand for a number of reasons. One of the primary challenges is that the paraprofessionals would have to switch unions and it’s hard to convince them to switch. TTO currently has 10 paraprofessionals who’ve agreed to switch. Many don’t have bachelor’s degrees and would need more support to complete the program, such as tutoring and peer support. The paraprofessionals usually also have family responsibilities to attend to. While paraprofessional recruitment is challenging, these teaching candidates tend to have similar ethnic and cultural backgrounds to their students, and also have valuable teaching experience and are therefore a promising pool for diverse teaching candidates.

Training and support

The program has partnered with three local universities: Holy Name University, California State East Bay, and California State TEACH, an online component of California State University. TTO has worked with these three entities to ensure that their summer preparation is relevant to the needs of Oakland teachers. They also supplement the program by bringing in Oakland teachers to demonstrate the curriculum and providing additional information about the Oakland context.
Teacher Interns attend university programs from May to July to get their pre-service training. They then participate in two weeks of intensive training before beginning school as the Teacher of Record in August. Participants continue to take classes in order to earn their credential while they teach. TTO also provides tutoring to help participants pass either the California Basic Educational Skills Test or the California Subject Examination for Teachers to obtain a teaching credential.

Once teachers are placed, TTO provides follow-up support. After surveying teachers, TTO found that the three main supports they need to fulfill their commitments were classroom supplies and support, advocacy for their needs within the school, and mentoring. Now, TTO provides all of these resources. TTO also hires instructional coaches using grant funds to support teachers. The coaches spend hours in the classroom observing the new teachers before giving them feedback and meeting with them once per month to develop content.

Results and evaluation

The program began in 2009 and therefore has not yet been evaluated. It placed 12 teachers in 2009, 30 in 2010, and hopes to place 45 teachers in 2011. Their teacher recruits are very diverse—44 percent are African American, about 15 percent are Latino, 4.3 percent White, 4.3 percent Asian, and about 23 percent are of mixed race. Their goal is to increase Latino representation.

TTO hired an evaluative team to develop a 360-degree evaluation model for teachers. The evaluation assesses teachers against California’s standards for the teaching profession, but also includes other qualitative and quantitative data. The 360-degree evaluation model includes a self-reflection, a principal evaluation, parent feedback, student feedback, and school site personnel evaluation. The evaluation is intended to complement the principal’s evaluation, which will include student achievement.
Findings, challenges, and lessons learned

Districts hoping to recruit and place African-American and Latino teachers still face an uphill battle. While districts often struggle to attract high-achieving candidates, recruiting and retaining minority teachers brings specific challenges, particularly in the area of providing sufficient resources and support to teaching candidates. The programs have to invest a great deal of time and labor to recruit interested and talented candidates while, competing with other, more prestigious opportunities. They also must balance the competing demands of finding candidates, but ensuring they are effective. They must support candidates financially and academically and ensure the programs are financially sustainable.

Successful programs are those that recognize the particular challenges in recruiting minorities and have met these challenges with creative and innovative solutions. Their success also comes from dedicating significant resources to this endeavor and being able to “meet candidates where they are” in both literal and figurative ways. Some of the findings, challenges, and lessons learned from the above programs include:

• Recruitment of talented minority candidates is a time- and labor-intensive process.

• Highly attractive candidates have many options and may view teaching as a less prestigious career option.

• Balancing recruitment and effectiveness is a remaining obstacle for some programs.

• Once candidates decide to enter the field, remaining barriers in terms of time and financially intensive licensure processes exist.

• Programs that seek to recruit candidates without college degrees must be prepared to address the particular challenges of sustaining candidates’ interest and abilities through college.
• All programs face some financial constraints in their efforts to recruit talented minority candidates.

Let’s consider each in turn.

Recruiting talented minority candidates is a time- and labor-intensive process

Programs that successfully recruit minority candidates engage in very aggressive recruitment and relationship-building activities. These range from one-on-one meetings between program staff and candidates, to organizing large events aimed at raising the program’s profile on campus. Students who have never considered teaching or have serious concerns about the profession needed to be fully supported through the process, especially if they are not receiving encouragement from family or others on campus. This level of support often requires a personalized approach—whether to support the candidate financially, link the candidate to successful graduates of the program, or be available to answer questions about the teaching field.

Competition with other opportunities and the lack of prestige

Candidates who are the best fit for teaching and have strong academic credentials often have a plethora of other opportunities available. Teaching is also perceived as a less prestigious career than other professions such as law or medicine. Competition is particularly intense for minority math and science majors who are also recruited from technology and engineering firms. High-achieving minority candidates often choose alternative certification programs that promise a shorter commitment to teaching and allow them to pursue other post-teaching careers. Teacher preparation programs that are committed to improving diversity must demonstrate a range of opportunities both in the classroom and beyond to stay competitive with other avenues of postsecondary employment.

TFA is one organization that has successfully done this. It often uses recent TFA alumni to encourage current students to apply for the program. High-profile alumni operate as model recruiters for the program and allow students to see themselves in the same role after graduation. TFA has also been successful at cre-
ating agreements with corporations and graduate programs that allow students to defer admission until after the end of their two-year commitment.

Other programs have attempted to seize upon the interest of students seeking opportunities to enter the public service field and “give back.” This strategy is particularly effective for recruiting black and Latino teachers that may have attended schools with a lack of minority teachers.

Balancing recruitment and effectiveness

Many programs that focus on recruiting minority teachers have not yet developed ways to assess a candidate’s potential for success in the classroom. The task of helping the teaching candidates fulfill the program requirements is often prioritized before ensuring that programs are selecting talented candidates who will be effective in the classroom. This is unfortunate, because a more diverse teaching force will not help students if they are not successful teachers.

Some programs have managed to accomplish both goals. For instance, the New Teacher Project recruits teaching candidates who have track records of success in other fields and the North Carolina Teaching Fellows program recruits candidates with strong academic backgrounds.

The cost and time of becoming a teacher

The licensure process can become expensive quickly for potential teachers. Credentialing exams, tuition for required courses, and state fees may present financial obstacles to teachers from low-income backgrounds. Working professionals have to allocate time to the certification process in addition to obligations at work and at home.

Several programs work with state education programs to credential program participants. Allowing multiple organizations, including nontraditional programs, to offer streamlined training and credentialing increases opportunities for minority candidates who would like to transition to teaching without entering a full-time teacher-preparation program.
Supporting candidates without bachelor’s degrees

When programs attempt to recruit and prepare candidates of color from the communities where their schools are located, the pool of candidates is not as likely to hold a postsecondary degree. It is much more challenging to help teachers with little postsecondary experience complete a bachelor’s degree in addition to completing their certification requirements.

These candidates are likely to have family responsibilities that they must juggle with work and teacher preparation. They may also have to deal with financial stress, from working in low-wage jobs. Finally, these candidates might have been out of school for a long period of time and may never have taken university courses. Adjusting to academic expectations in a rigorous teacher-preparation program and completing courses could therefore take a much longer period of time than for candidates who already have bachelor’s degrees.

All of these challenges must be addressed for a program to successfully recruit and retain these candidates.

Financial sustainability of the programs

Several of the programs profiled in this report are funded by short-term grants, though program staff is trying to identify more permanent sources of funding. Others are fortunate to have some state or district support. Still others benefit from some type of support from their university partners—whether through staff resources or tailored training. Programs will have to build a diverse portfolio of long-term funding sources in order to ensure sustainability.
Recommendations

There are a variety of policy and program levers that could enhance the success of programs that recruit and prepare diverse teaching candidates. Federal policy should support state reporting and accountability to provide common measures of effectiveness across teacher preparation programs. Federal policy could also provide more effective financial support to teaching candidates, by modifying the TEACH grant program and allowing student teachers to receive work-study support. State and district policy should allow a diversity of providers of teacher preparation, offer low cost options for teacher preparation and certification, and support statewide programs to recruit and prepare minority teachers.

Finally, programs should balance high standards with intensive support by engaging in targeted recruitment, continuous evaluation, and providing intensive support to candidates. They should also ensure they are meeting districts’ needs by working closely with partner districts and requiring a significant time commitment from teaching candidates.

Recommendations for federal policy

Require reporting and accountability

States should be required to develop reporting and accountability systems for teacher-and principal-preparation programs within the state as a condition of receiving funding under Title II of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act. This would ensure that all preparation programs within a state are evaluated by the same high standards. A state reporting and accountability system should include at least the following measures: a teacher-effectiveness measure that reports the extent to which program graduates help their K-12 students to learn; a measure of classroom teaching performance of program graduates; program graduates’ persistence rates in teaching; and feedback surveys from preparation program graduates and from their employers.35

Programs could also be encouraged to report on efforts to recruit and graduate under-represented minorities. The department can highlight successful programs and practices as part of the TEACH.gov initiative.
Strengthen the TEACH Grant program

Entering the teaching field can be an expensive endeavor and especially daunting for interested students of color from low-income backgrounds. The TEACH grant program offers $4,000 grants to college students who intend to teach in a low-income school after graduation. TEACH grant recipients must commit to teaching for at least four years in a low-income school and spend at least 51 percent of the time teaching in a high-need subject like math or special education.

The TEACH program should be a powerful lever to attract high-achieving candidates to the teaching field. The program, unfortunately, is underutilized and does not adequately focus on attracting students with the highest potential for success in the classroom. A recent study found that only 30,650 awards were given in 2009-10 even though hundreds of thousands of teaching degrees are granted annually. Most accredited programs are qualified to give the grants even if they don’t have a history of producing successful teachers or teachers that stay in the profession.

As states move to better track the success of graduates from teacher preparation programs, the TEACH program should be modified to limit qualifying institutions to those with a proven track record of producing effective teachers. The Department of Education could also consider increasing the amount of individual grants as it becomes more selective in the institutions and students who qualify for TEACH awards.

Offer federal work-study for student teaching and internship opportunities

Most teacher preparation programs, as well as alternative certification programs, have an element of student teaching. The Department of Education should allow low-income student teachers to collect federal work-study dollars while student teaching.

Recommendations for states and districts

Encourage policies that increase diversity

State policies should allow nonprofit organizations, charter schools, and school districts with track records of preparing effective candidates for high-needs
schools to certify teachers. These organizations could then create their own programs that prepare diverse candidates to meet the needs of their schools. All providers should be required to track the effectiveness of candidates once they are placed in the classroom using a variety of performance indicators, including student achievement.

Create lower-cost options for preparation and certification

States should ensure that alternative certification programs are affordable to a wide range of nontraditional candidates by limiting university courses and learning experiences to those that are essential to beginning teachers.37 States should specify the competencies new teachers must demonstrate in order to be certified, rather than the numbers of courses or credit hours new teachers should take. Providers of teacher preparation programs could then design courses and learning experiences to ensure new teachers demonstrate these skills.38 States should encourage a range of certification providers, including nonprofit organizations and charter school management organizations, to promote competition in terms of quality and cost. States can also pay for tuition for talented candidates who agree to teach in high-needs schools for four or five years.

Create targeted, statewide recruitment programs

States can create targeted, teacher recruitment programs that seek to attract high-achieving minority students to the teaching field. The Illinois Legislature, for example, established a statewide Grow Your Own program in 2005. The purpose of the Illinois program is to “identify, train, and employ 1000 or more fully qualified teachers who have previous ties to the low-income communities where they will work.”

The creation of a statewide program allows a state to combine human capital reform goals with a targeted effort to recruit minority teachers. As states move to create new ways of assessing teacher effectiveness, state-sponsored programs can lead the way in recruiting minority teachers who will succeed under new evaluation systems. State-led programs can also be models for teacher preparation, training, and professional development.
Recommendations for programs

High standards for participation

Successful programs recruit minority teachers with a high likelihood of being effective in the classroom. These programs concentrate on finding candidates with a core set of competencies that will translate to success in the classroom instead of focusing on meeting minimum standards for entering the profession. Core competencies often include strong academic skills, an ability to engage students, a desire to improve student performance at challenging schools, a willingness to work with school communities, and a commitment to working in a school for a set period of time.

Programs are at different points in the development of tools for measuring the effectiveness of their graduates but must also focus on developing recruitment tools that assess potential candidates for qualities of successful teachers.

Targeted recruitment

Aggressive efforts are necessary to increase the number of teachers of color. These efforts are wasted, however, if candidates are unlikely to become teachers or stay in the classroom. In addition to identifying core competencies, successful programs target those candidates who exhibit a desire to work in hard-to-staff schools and understand the challenges of doing so.

To successfully compete with students’ other opportunities, TFA has devoted resources to showcasing well-known and accomplished students that enter the program to increase its popularity on campuses. TFA has also worked hard to change the perception of teaching as a prestigious postcollege career. Recruiters emphasize the role of teachers as leaders in their schools and classrooms and market this message to campus leaders. TFA’s low acceptance rate also contributes to its reputation as a sought-after opportunity.

High-achieving candidates are often sought after for other career opportunities, so successful programs need to be aggressive in communicating with applicants and ensuring that they matriculate into the program.
Require significant commitment to high-need schools

Once programs have identified successful candidates, they must also focus on keeping them in the highest-needs schools. Tying stipends and loan forgiveness to service in high-need schools will ensure that candidates understand and follow through on their commitment. In North Carolina, North Carolina Teaching fellows must agree to teach for four years in a public school or repay the state with interest. Programs can construct similar requirements with a focus on service in high needs schools.

Constant evaluation of efforts

High-performing programs evaluate their recruitment efforts, the types of candidates that apply to the program, and matriculation and retention rates once in the classroom. These programs do not simply “get people in the door.” Instead, they are focused on bringing high-performing, committed teachers into low-performing schools and classrooms. Minority recruitment programs must be able to evaluate their success in placing highly effective minority teachers as states and districts move toward more rigorous teacher evaluation systems.

Intensive support for nontraditional candidates

Programs that serve paraprofessionals and other school staff frequently need to devote resources to providing support services, such as tutoring, and help navigating college courses because these candidates tend to have little prior experience with higher education. These programs therefore need to allocate more staff time to guiding participants through the preparation and certification process than programs serving career changers. The pay-off can be great, with teachers who have strong cultural competency and are committed to staying in the community indefinitely.

Strong partnerships with receiving districts

Programs need to develop strong partnerships with receiving districts to ensure they are preparing teachers that meet districts’ needs. Effective programs fre-
quently prepare candidates in the grades and subject areas that districts identify as areas of need. The programs also know how many teachers to recruit based on the districts’ estimated vacancies. Finally, programs should work with districts to ensure they are preparing teachers to teach the district curriculum, and to teach according to the districts’ professional standards and evaluation metrics.
Conclusion

America’s rapidly diversifying student population demands an equally diverse teaching force. Policies that strengthen teacher training, recruitment, selection, and retention should include an emphasis on increasing the number of minority teachers in the field. And programs and policies enacted to further diversify the teaching force must also reflect lessons learned about the qualities of successful teachers and the need for high standards for entrance into the field.

As Secretary Duncan’s quote at the beginning of this report indicates, there must be a national commitment to these efforts. Just as national attention has focused on increasing the number of blacks and Latinos in science and technology, local, state, and federal programs and policies need to be created to aggressively bring high-achieving minorities to teaching.
About the authors

**Saba Bireda** is deputy director of the Poverty & Race Research Action Council. Prior to coming to PRRAC, Bireda was an Education Policy Analyst at the Center for American Progress. She was also a litigation associate at the law firm Morgan Lewis and a staff attorney with the Education Law Center in Philadelphia. Bireda is a graduate of Harvard Law School and Stanford University, and worked for two years for Teach For America in the District of Columbia Public Schools.

**Robin Chait** is currently working on the implementation of the District of Columbia’s Race to the Top grant. In her role as Effectiveness Manager, she is responsible for overseeing the projects related to teacher and leader effectiveness. She is the former Associate Director for Teacher Quality at the Center for American Progress, where she focused her work on teacher and principal quality and effectiveness. Prior to joining American Progress, Chait was an independent consultant and worked with Practical Strategy, LLC, and Cross and Joftus, LLC, to conduct research and write reports for nonprofit organizations and government agencies. She was also a D.C. Teaching Fellow and teacher in the District of Columbia. Chait holds a master’s degree in teaching from American University, a master’s in public policy from Georgetown University, and a bachelor of arts in political science from Rutgers University.

Acknowledgements

The Center for American Progress thanks the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation for generously providing support for this paper.
Endnotes

1 Brian Lehrer Show, “Education Reform, Secretary Arne Duncan Weighs In” (2010).


7 See Robin Chait, “Ensuring Effective Teachers for All Students: Six State Strategies for Attracting and Retaining Effective Teachers in High-Poverty and High-Minority Schools” (Washington: Center for American Progress, 2009).

8 Ingersoll and May, “Recruitment, Retention, and the Minority Teacher Shortage.”

9 Ibid.

10 Ibid.


13 Ibid.


15 Ibid.

16 Ibid.

17 Betty Achinstein and others, “Retaining Teachers of Color.”

18 Ibid.


20 Ibid.


22 Teach For America recruits at many of the top colleges and universities, which are ranked as “most selective” and “more selective” schools according to U.S. News and World Report. In addition, Teach For America recruits at some “selective” and “less selective” colleges and universities.

23 Personal communication with Stacey Johnson and Amber Bankson, Teach for America, December 9, 2010.

24 Personal communication with Shani Jackson Dowell, Teach for America, October 5, 2010.

25 Personal communication with Layla Avila, Vice-President for Fellowship Programs, The National Teacher Project.

26 “Where are the Minority Teachers?” available at http://nashvillicitypaper.com/content/city-news/where-are-minority-teachers.

27 The New Teacher Project, Teacher Fellows Program, Overview and 2010 Results.

28 Information for this report was taken from a telephone interview with Deborah Voltz, director, Center for Urban Education and Urban Teacher Enhancement Program, available at http://www.ed.uab.edu/utep/.


30 Information from this profile was taken from an interview with Danny Bland, director of recruitment, NC Teaching Fellows Scholarship Program; an email exchange with Kerry Mebane, state director, NC Teaching Fellows Scholarship Program and Public School Forum of North Carolina; and “North Carolina Teaching Fellows Program,” available at http://www.teachingfellows.org/.

31 Information for this profile was taken from an interview with Rachelle Rogers-Ard, program manager, Teach Tomorrow in Oakland; and Oakland Unified School District, Teach Tomorrow in Oakland, available at http://ntsd.ousd.k12.ca.us/Teach%20Tomorrow.html.


33 Ibid.

34 Interview with Rachelle Rogers-Ard, Program Manager, Teach Tomorrow in Oakland.


37 Robin Chait and Michele McLaughlin, “Realizing the Promise, How State Policy Can Support Alternative Certification Programs” (Washington: Center for American Progress, 2009).

38 Ibid.
The Center for American Progress is a nonpartisan research and educational institute dedicated to promoting a strong, just, and free America that ensures opportunity for all. We believe that Americans are bound together by a common commitment to these values and we aspire to ensure that our national policies reflect these values. We work to find progressive and pragmatic solutions to significant domestic and international problems and develop policy proposals that foster a government that is “of the people, by the people, and for the people.”